
SENATE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

Senator Benjamin Allen, Chair

2017 - 2018 Regular

Bill No: AB 1399 **Hearing Date:** July 12, 2017
Author: Nazarian
Version: June 19, 2017
Urgency: No **Fiscal:** Yes
Consultant: Brandon Darnell

Subject: Teacher credentialing: recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights

SUMMARY

This bill authorizes the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC) to convene a workgroup to develop program standards for the issuance of a “recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights” for holders of a single subject teaching credential.

BACKGROUND

Existing law:

- 1) Establishes the CTC and vests the Commission with the power and duty to, among other things, establish professional standards, assessments, and examinations for entry and advancement in the education profession. (Education Code § 44225)
- 2) Establishes the minimum requirements for preliminary and clear teaching credentials for single subjects and for designated subjects career technical education. (EC § 44260 et. seq.)
- 3) Authorizes the CTC to establish the Recognition of Study in Linked Learning and to establish a working group to develop the Recognition of Study in Linked Learning, and specifies that the Recognition of Study shall not be considered a type of authorization, shall not be used as a condition of employment, shall not replace as subject matter competence requirement, and shall not be used in making employment decisions. (Education Code Section 44257.3)
- 4) Requires the CTC, upon recommendation of the tribal government of a federally recognized Indian tribe in California to issue an American Indian language-culture credential to a candidate that meets certain requirements, including demonstrated fluency in that tribe’s language and/or knowledge in that tribe’s culture, based on an assessment developed and administered by that federally recognized Indian tribe, and specifies that the American Indian language-culture credential authorizes the holder to teach the American Indian language, or culture, or both, for which the credential was issued in California public schools in preschool, kindergarten, grades 1 to 12, inclusive, and in adult education courses.

- 5) Requires the adopted course of study for grades 7 to 12, inclusive, to offer courses in the social sciences, drawing upon the disciplines of anthropology, economics, geography, history, political science, psychology, and sociology, designed to fit the maturity of the pupils, and requires that instruction to include, among other things, particular attention to the study of the inhumanity of genocide, slavery, and the Holocaust, and contemporary issues. (EC § 51220)
- 6) Encourages the department to incorporate into publications that provide examples of curriculum resources for teacher use those materials developed by publishers of nonfiction, trade books, and primary sources, or other public or private organizations, that are age appropriate and consistent with the subject frameworks on history and social science that deal with the Armenian, Cambodian, Darfur, and Rwandan genocides. (Education Code Section 51226.3)
- 7) Encourages all of the following:
 - (a) Instruction in the origins of genocide as a phenomenon throughout history that continues to the present day.
 - (b) Content providers and teachers to promote pupil analysis of genocides, including the ethnic, religious, and political causes.
 - (c) Content providers and teachers to incorporate instructional materials for pupils that examine the possible means of preventing and halting genocide policies or interventions by the United Nations, other groups of nations, or the United States.
 - (d) Examinations of interventions to prevent genocides should include arguments and evidence for and against intervention, the role of public support for the intervention, and the possible consequences of such interventions.

ANALYSIS

This bill authorizes the Commission on Teacher Credentialing to convene a workgroup to develop program standards for the issuance of a “recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights” for holders of a single subject teaching credential. Specifically, this bill:

- 1) Defines "recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights" to mean a statement added to a single subject teaching credential to indicate that the holder of the single subject teaching credential has completed a commission-approved program that can be applied to the academic instruction authorized by his or her credential.
- 2) Authorizes a recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights teacher education program may be offered as part of an initial teacher preparation program or as a separate program for teachers who possess a valid single subject teaching credential.

- 3) Authorizes the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC) to convene a workgroup to develop program standards for the issuance of a recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights for holders of a single subject teaching credential, and specifies the workgroup may include, but is not limited to, all of the following:
 - a) The Superintendent (SPI) or his or her representative.
 - b) Representatives from approved teacher preparation programs, including at least one representative from the California Community Colleges, the California State University, the University of California, and the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities. To the extent practicable, the representatives shall have an academic interest or prior experience in preparing teachers to teach pupils in genocide, atrocities, and human rights.
 - c) A researcher.
 - d) A historian.
 - e) A representative from a school district, a county office of education, or a charter school.
 - f) A history-social science teacher.
 - g) A representative of other organizations deemed appropriate by the commission.
 - h) A parent representative.
- 3) Specifies the duties of the workgroup may also include, but are not limited to, all of the following:
 - a) Advise the Governor and the Legislature on strategies to improve genocide, human rights, and tolerance education.
 - b) Identify all programs in the state that train teachers in genocide, atrocities, and human rights studies.
 - c) Identify all nonprofit organizations in the state that train teachers in genocide, atrocities, and human rights.
 - d) Identify strategies for improving access to genocide, atrocities, and human rights education materials and information.
 - e) Promote education on genocide, atrocities, and human rights.
- 4) Authorizes the commission to add a recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights to the single subject teaching credential of a teacher who meets the established standards.

- 5) States that it is intent of the Legislature that a successful candidate for a recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights be able to demonstrate appropriate knowledge, as determined by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC), based on the recommendations of the workgroup.
- 6) Encourages the California State University and other teacher preparation institutions to establish goals to increase the number of teachers participating in genocide, atrocities, and human rights education programs.
- 7) Authorizes the CTC and the Superintendent of Public Instruction to gather and post, on an appropriate Internet Web site, a list of nonprofit organizations and best practices from school districts and schools on curriculum development and professional development relating to implementing and sustaining genocide, atrocities, and human rights education programs.
- 8) Requires the CTC to use private funds to support the development of the recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights, and prohibits the use of General Fund money for that purpose.
- 9) Prohibits the recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights from being considered a type of authorization, from being used as a condition of employment, from replacing a subject matter competency requirement, and from being used in making employment decisions.
- 10) Specifies that workgroup may only be convened only after the Department of Finance (DOF) determines that private funds, in an amount sufficient to fully support the activities of the workgroup, have been deposited with the state.
- 11) Requires DOF, if it determines that sufficient funding has been secured to establish and support the activities of the workgroup, to file a written statement with the Secretary of the Senate, the Chief Clerk of the Assembly, and the Legislative Counsel memorializing that this determination has been made.

STAFF COMMENTS

- 1) ***Need for the bill.*** According to the author, “While the subjects of genocide, atrocities, and human rights are part of the California Department of Education’s recently updated History-Social Science framework, more can be done to teach these important topics.

Developing program standards for the issuance of a recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights for those who hold single-subject teaching credentials and who will be teaching pupils in history-social science classes will allow teachers to expand their expertise in how to effectively teach genocide, atrocities, and human rights.

In the past 150 years, tens of millions of men, women, and children have lost their lives in genocides and mass atrocities. California is home to the largest number of refugees and immigrants in the United States, many of whom are genocide survivors or descendants of genocide survivors.

Equipping teachers with the tools to engage and educate students in genocide, atrocities, and human rights is critical for training up sensitive, socially-conscious individuals. Creating a recognition of study will increase the number of teachers able to effectively teach genocide, and accomplish the goal of preparing generations of Californians to be engaged, global citizens.”

- 2) ***Previous emphasis/concentration programs.*** According to the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC), a recognition of study is an approach that essentially replicates the foundational basis for previous CTC-authorized emphasis and concentration programs listed on a credential, even though someone without the emphasis or concentration could also provide the same service; examples include a Middle School Emphasis or Early Childhood Emphasis. Under that previous approach, an emphasis program was intended to provide a concentration of coursework and field experiences emphasizing one specific part of the preliminary multiple or single subject professional preparation program, which, at the time, had a 1-year unit cap. Credential reform enacted in 1998 required all program sponsors to embed additional content into their program, including content related to English learners, which further limited the ability of a program to offer an emphasis within the 1-year unit cap. That limit was extended to two years of units in 2014. It is the CTC’s current practice to list credential authorizations only when the authorization is necessary in order for the teacher or another credential holder to provide specified instruction or a specific service.

This bill prohibits the recognition of study in genocide, atrocities, and human rights from being considered a type of authorization.

- 3) ***What is a recognition of study?*** According to the CTC, a recognition of study would provide a CTC-issued confirmation that an individual has had more in-depth and/or specialized preparation within a specific topic addressed within their teacher preparation. According to CTC, it should be noted that a recognition of study would not provide any additional credential authorization to the holder beyond what the holder’s base credential already authorizes. It would serve primarily to indicate that an individual has in-depth knowledge in a particular area and/or instructional approach.

Additionally, according to the CTC, currently some of California’s teacher preparation programs issue their own specialized designations, including, for example, a “Certificate of Advanced Study in Middle-Level Education” at California State University, San Marcos, and a “Middle-Level Emphasis” at San Jose State University.

- 4) ***Previous attempts at establishing a recognition of study.*** AB 1304 (Block, Chapter 259, Statutes of 2011) authorized the CTC to establish a working group to develop the Recognition of Study in Linked Learning. When the CTC convened the working group, the working group made 40 recommendations, including those regarding the recognition of study. The CTC has prioritized those 40 recommendations and has begun implementing them in priority order. As such, the CTC has yet to implement the recognition of study in Linked Learning. In light of this workload issue, *the committee may wish to consider* whether the

recognition of study in genocide should be an additional priority for the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC).

Additionally, AB 1853 (Bonilla, 2012) would have authorized the CTC to convene a workgroup to develop program standards for the issuance of a recognition of study in transitional kindergarten for holders of a multiple subject teaching credential who will be teaching pupils enrolled in a transitional kindergarten program. AB 1853 was vetoed by the Governor with the following message:

“I am returning Assembly Bill 1853 without my signature. This bill would require the Commission on Teacher Credentialing to create a committee to do the preliminary work that would be required to create yet another teaching credential -- something we don't need.”

- 5) ***Proliferation of recognitions of study?*** Similarly to diploma seals, which this committee has reviewed three times since 2011 (biliteracy, STEM, and civic engagement) and specific curriculum framework requirements, which this committee has adopted a policy to discourage, *the committee may wish to consider whether* it will see similar measures to establish a recognition of study in other subject areas if it approves this measure.

The *committee may also wish to consider* the value of a recognition of study to a teacher candidate, given that the bill prohibits it from being used as a condition of employment or from being used in making employment decisions.

- 6) ***Previous Legislation.*** SB 1380 (Wyland, Chapter 441, Statutes of 2014) required the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) to consider including the Armenian Genocide in the next revision of the history/social science framework and specifically identifies the Armenian Genocide when encouraging the incorporation of oral testimony into the teaching of human rights and genocide.

SJR 21 (De León and Yee, Chapter 32, Statutes of 2014) designated and encouraged the people of California to commemorate the month of April 2014, as “California Month of Remembrance for the Armenian Genocide of 1915–1923,” and called upon the Congress and the President of the United States to act likewise and to formally and consistently recognize and reaffirm the historical truth that the atrocities committed against the Armenian people constituted genocide. The measure commended conscientious educators who teach about human rights and genocide. The measure called upon the President to work toward equitable, constructive, stable, and durable Armenian-Turkish relations and a fair, just, and comprehensive international resolution of this crime against humanity, and called upon the Republic of Turkey to acknowledge the facts of the Armenian Genocide and to work toward a just resolution.

AJR 35 (Perez, Chapter 35, Statutes of 2014) designated the week of April 20 through 26, 2014, as “California Week of Remembrance for the Armenian Genocide of 1915–1923,” and would memorialize the Congress and the President of the United States to observe the California Week of Remembrance

for the Armenian Genocide by participating in the Armenian Genocide Commemorative Project.

AJR 41 (Ian Calderon, Chapter 41, Statutes of 2014) commended the extraordinary service delivered by Near East Relief to the survivors of the Armenian Genocide and the Assyrian Genocide.

AB 659 (Nazarian, 2013) would have required the California Department of Education to include the Armenian Genocide in its published curriculum resources and encourages the incorporation of specific instances of genocide into existing curriculum, professional development activities, and in the next revision of the history/social science curriculum framework. AB 659 was held by this committee.

AB 1853 (Bonilla, 2012) would have authorized the Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC) to convene a workgroup to develop program standards for the issuance of a recognition of study in transitional kindergarten for holders of a multiple subject teaching credential who will be teaching pupils enrolled in a transitional kindergarten program. AB 1853 was vetoed by the Governor.

AB 1304 (Block, Chapter 259, Statutes of 2011) established the Recognition of Study in Linked Learning; authorized the CTC to established a working group to develop the Recognition of Study in Linked Learning; and, specified the Recognition of Study shall not be considered a type of authorization, shall not be used as a condition of employment, shall not replace as subject matter competence requirement and shall not be used in making employment decisions.

SB 234 (Wyland, 2009) would have required the CTC to consider an oral history component specifically related to genocides, including but not limited to, the Darfur, Rwandan, Cambodian, Jewish Holocaust, or Armenian genocides in the history/social science curriculum. SB 234 died in the Assembly Appropriations Committee.

SB 424 (Poochigian, Chapter 9, Statutes of 2005) established April 24 of each year as the "California Day of Remembrance of the Armenian Genocide" and the period beginning on the Sunday before that day through the following Sunday as the days of remembrance of the Armenian Genocide.

ACR 116 (Yee, Chapter 114, Statutes of 2004) urged the State Board of Education to take action at the next instructional materials primary adoption cycle to ensure that history/social science textbooks used in California schools in grade 10 fairly and accurately portray human rights violations and other historical atrocities in a comprehensive manner.

SJR 1 (Poochigian, Chapter 18, Statutes of 2003) designated April 24, 2003, as the "California Day of Remembrance of the Armenian Genocide of 1915-1923" and requests Congress to likewise act to commemorate the Armenian Genocide.

Armenian National Committee of America – Western Region
Genocide Education Project
Los Angeles Unified School District
An individual

OPPOSITION

None received

-- END --